An Assessment of the Effectiveness of Civil Citation as an Alternative to Arrest Among Youth Apprehended by Law Enforcement

NIJ Funded Researcher-Practitioner Partnership Grant

Background

- Civil Citation programs gaining popularity
  - Based on labeling theory
- Civil Citation intended to accomplish 3 goals
  - Keep kids from moving further in juvenile justice system
  - Reduce costs to juvenile justice system
  - Reduce juvenile recidivism
- Success of these programs can vary based on implementation
- Mixed findings on whether these types of diversion programs effectively reduces recidivism

Data & Methods

- Data provided by DJJ on all first-time misdemeanor juvenile offenders that received a referral between January 2002 and July 2016

- Full Cohort: 437,449 cases

- 2011 to 2016 Cohort: 111,473 cases

- Types of Analyses:
  - Study 1: Time Series Analysis
  - Study 2: Multi-Level Modeling
  - Study 3: Logistic Regression

Descriptive Information

- 60 out of 67 counties implemented civil citation

- 41 counties implemented after 2011 state initiative

- Average use of civil citation ranges from 0% to 90%

- Between 2011 and 2016, 25% of eligible juveniles across the state received civil citation

Study 1: The Implementation of Civil Citation

Implementation Findings

- 13 counties had successful immediate implementation
- Brevard, Citrus, Monroe, Santa Rosa, Baker, Broward, Collier, Duval, Gadsden, Manatee, Osceola, Palm Beach, Seminole

- 6 counties experienced immediate net-widening
- Desoto, Hernando, Nassau, Pasco, Pinellas, and Union

- 9 counties had long-term successful implementation
- Alachua, Broward, Collier, Indian River, Lake, Osceola, Palm Beach, Pasco, and Volusia

- 1 county experienced long-term net-widening
- Putnam

- Majority of counties did not experience any significant changes

Implementation Findings

County Factors	Successful Implementation vs. Other Implementation	
	Direction	Significance
Juvenile Arrest Rate	→	*
UCR Crime Rate	→	*
Law Enforcement		
Unemployment Rate		
Poverty Rate	←	*
Median Income	→	*
Graduation Rate		
Percent Black	←	*
Percent Hispanic	→	*
Urbanization	→	*
Youth Density		
Program Buy In	←	*

Study 2: The Predictors of Civil Citation Use

Juvenile Predictors of Civil Citation

Juvenile Characteristics	Received Civil Citation
Age	Older juveniles less likely
Male	Male juveniles less likely
Black	Black juveniles less likely
Hispanic	NS
Offense - Violent	NS
Offense - Property	Juveniles with property offense more likely
Offense - Drugs	NS
School Offense	Juveniles with school offense more likely
Domestic Violence	Juveniles with domestic violence offense less likely

Contextual Predictors of Civil Citation

County Characteristics	Juvenile Receiving Civil Citation
Youth Density	Juveniles in counties with higher youth density less likely
Percent Black	Overall, Juveniles in counties with higher percent black more likely*
Percent Hispanic	NS
Urbanization	NS
Graduation Rate	NS
Percent Republican	NS
UCR Crime Rate	Juveniles in counties with higher crime rates more likely
Juvenile Arrest Rates	NS
Unemployment Rate	NS
Poverty Rate	NS
Median Household Income	NS
LEOS per capita	NS
Law Enforcement Agencies	Juveniles in counties with more LE agencies less likely*
Referral Agencies (number)	NS
Buy in	Juveniles in counties with buy in more likely
Agency Participation Rate	Juveniles in counties with higher agency participation more likely*

Study 3:
Civil Citation and Recidivism

Recidivism Findings

- Examined arrest at 6 month, 12 month, and 3 year follow up periods

- Juveniles demographics and offense characteristics included as controls

- Juveniles that received civil citation were less likely to be rearrested in general, and at each follow up period compared to juveniles that received an arrest

- The reduced likelihood of arrest decreased with progressively later follow up periods

Policy Implications

- Provide occasional "booster shots" to counties
- Re-trainings or conferences
- Help keep use consistent
- Increase use in general
- Increase Data Collection
- Implementation Process
- Officer Decision Making
- Risk Assessments

Thank You!